

**U.S. District Court – District of Colorado  
District of Colorado (Denver)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:18-cv-00302-RPM**

Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center v. United States  
Department of Homeland Security et al  
Assigned to: Judge Richard P. Matsch  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 02/07/2018  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of  
Information Act of 1974  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**Civil Rights Education and  
Enforcement Center**

represented by **Amber Rose Gonzales**  
Ballard Spahr, LLP–Denver  
1225 Seventeenth Street  
Suite 2300  
Denver, CO 80202–5596  
303–299–7392  
Fax: 303–296–3956  
Email: [gonzalesa@ballardspahr.com](mailto:gonzalesa@ballardspahr.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Elizabeth B. Jordan**  
Civil Rights Education and Enforcement  
Center–Denver  
104 Broadway  
Suite 400  
Denver, CO 80203  
303–757–7901  
Email: [ejordan@creeclaw.org](mailto:ejordan@creeclaw.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Steven David Zansberg**  
Ballard Spahr, LLP–Denver  
1225 Seventeenth Street  
Suite 2300  
Denver, CO 80202–5596  
303–376–2409  
Fax: 303–296–3956  
Email: [zansbergs@ballardspahr.com](mailto:zansbergs@ballardspahr.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Timothy Patrick Fox**  
Civil Rights Education and Enforcement  
Center–Denver  
104 Broadway  
Suite 400  
Denver, CO 80203  
303–757–7901  
Fax: 303–595–9705  
Email: [tfox@creeclaw.org](mailto:tfox@creeclaw.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Thomas B. Kelley**  
Killmer Lane & Newman, LLP  
1543 Champa Street  
Suite 400  
Denver, CO 80202  
303–571–1000  
Fax: 303–571–1001  
Email: [tkelley@kln-law.com](mailto:tkelley@kln-law.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant****United States Department of Homeland Security**represented by **Ian J. Kellogg**  
U.S. Attorney's Office-Denver  
1801 California Street  
Suite 1600  
Denver, CO 80202  
303-454-0100  
Email: [ian.kellogg@usdoj.gov](mailto:ian.kellogg@usdoj.gov)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED****Mark S. Pestal**  
U.S. Attorney's Office-Denver  
1801 California Street  
Suite 1600  
Denver, CO 80202  
303-454-0101  
Fax: 303-454-0404  
Email: [mark.pestal@usdoj.gov](mailto:mark.pestal@usdoj.gov)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED****Defendant****United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement**represented by **Ian J. Kellogg**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED****Mark S. Pestal**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

| Date Filed | #        | Docket Text  |
|------------|----------|--|
| 02/07/2018 | <u>1</u> | COMPLAINT <i>for declaratory and injunctive relief</i> against United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement (Filing fee \$ 400, Receipt Number 1082-5934785) Attorney Thomas B. Kelley added to party Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center(pty:pla), filed by Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 - FOIA Request, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 - Email, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 - Automatic Reply, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4 - Email, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5 - Automatic Reply, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6 - Email, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7 - Email, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8 - FOIA Request, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9 - Email, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10 - Automatic Reply, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11 - FOIA Request, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12 - Email, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13 - Automatic Reply, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14 - FOIA Request, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15 - Email, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16 - Automatic Reply, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 17 - Email, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 18 - FOIA Tracker Screenshot, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 19 - Email, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 20 - Automatic Reply, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 21 - Email, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 22 - Email, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 23 - Automatic Reply, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 24 - Email, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 25 - ICE FOIA Screenshot, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 26 - ICE FOIA Screenshot, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 27 - ICE FOIA Request, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 28 - Email, # <u>29</u> Exhibit 29 - Automatic Reply, # <u>30</u> Exhibit 30 - Email, # <u>31</u> Exhibit 31 - Email, # <u>32</u> Exhibit 32 - Email Response, # <u>33</u> Exhibit 33 - Automatic Acknowledgement, # <u>34</u> Exhibit 34 - Email, # <u>35</u> Exhibit 35 - ICE FOIA Screenshot, # <u>36</u> Exhibit 36 - ICE FOIA Screenshot, # <u>37</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(Kelley, Thomas) (Entered: 02/07/2018) |
| 02/07/2018 | 2        | ADVISORY NOTICE OF NONCOMPLIANCE WITH COURT RULES/PROCEDURES:re: <u>1</u> Complaint filed by attorney Thomas B. Kelley. <b>DO NOT REFILE THE DOCUMENT. Action to take</b> - counsel must submit a change of contact request through the Attorney Services Portal Account pursuant to D.C.COLO.LAttyR 5(c) and 3.5 of the Electronic Case Filing Procedures (Civil cases).(Text Only Entry) (rvill, ) (Entered: 02/07/2018)   |
| 02/07/2018 | 3        | Case assigned to Judge Richard P. Matsch and drawn to Magistrate Judge Kristen L. Mix. Text Only Entry. (rvill, ) (Entered: 02/07/2018)  |

|            |           |  |
|------------|-----------|--|
| 02/07/2018 | <u>4</u>  | Magistrate Judge consent form issued pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 636(c). No Summons Issued. (rvill, ) (Entered: 02/07/2018)  |
| 02/09/2018 | <u>5</u>  | NOTICE of Entry of Appearance by Amber Rose Gonzales on behalf of Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center Attorney Amber Rose Gonzales added to party Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center(pty:pla) (Gonzales, Amber) (Entered: 02/09/2018)   |
| 02/09/2018 | <u>6</u>  | SUMMONS REQUEST as to U.S. Department of Homeland Security by Plaintiff Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center. (Gonzales, Amber) (Entered: 02/09/2018)   |
| 02/09/2018 | <u>7</u>  | SUMMONS REQUEST as to U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement by Plaintiff Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center. (Gonzales, Amber) (Entered: 02/09/2018)   |
| 02/09/2018 | <u>8</u>  | SUMMONS issued by Clerk as to U.S. Immigration and Customs, (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Summons as to Department of Homeland Security) (evana, ) (Entered: 02/09/2018)  |
| 02/15/2018 | <u>9</u>  | SUMMONS Returned Executed upon defendant(s) United States Department of Homeland Security served on 2/12/2018, answer due 4/13/2018. (Gonzales, Amber) (Entered: 02/15/2018)   |
| 02/15/2018 | <u>10</u> | SUMMONS Returned Executed upon defendant(s) United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement served on 2/12/2018, answer due 4/13/2018. (Gonzales, Amber) (Entered: 02/15/2018)   |
| 03/06/2018 | <u>11</u> | NOTICE of Entry of Appearance by Mark S. Pestal on behalf of All Defendants Attorney Mark S. Pestal added to party United States Department of Homeland Security(pty:dft), Attorney Mark S. Pestal added to party United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement(pty:dft) (Pestal, Mark) (Entered: 03/06/2018)  |
| 04/13/2018 | <u>12</u> | Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer or Otherwise Respond re <u>1</u> Complaint,,,,, by Defendants United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Kellogg, Ian) (Entered: 04/13/2018)   |
| 04/16/2018 | <u>13</u> | ORDER Granting <u>12</u> unopposed motion for extension of time, to and including May 7, 2018, to response to complaint, by Judge Richard P. Matsch on 4/16/2018. (ktera) (Entered: 04/16/2018)  |
| 05/07/2018 | <u>14</u> | ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint, by United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Kellogg, Ian) (Entered: 05/07/2018)   |
| 05/08/2018 | <u>15</u> | PROCEDURAL ORDER NUMBER ONE Counsel will meet and confer as required by Rule 26 (f)(2) within 30 days from the date of this order. Lead counsel shall attend the conference in person. The disclosures required by Rule 26(a)(1)(A) shall be made within 14 days after that conference. Counsel for the plaintiff will telephone chambers [303-844-4627] within 10 days after the disclosures to set a date and time for a Scheduling Conference pursuant to Rule 16. The instructions for preparation of the Scheduling Order and the form of that order are found at <a href="http://www.cod.uscourts.gov/judges/judges.aspx">http://www.cod.uscourts.gov/judges/judges.aspx</a> , by Judge Richard P. Matsch on 5/8/2018. (ktera) (Entered: 05/08/2018) |
| 06/21/2018 | <u>16</u> | ORDER SETTING SCHEDULING CONFERENCE A scheduling conference will be held on August 15, 2018, at 10:00 a.m. in the Conference Room, Second Floor, the Byron White United States Courthouse, 1823 Stout Street, Denver, Colorado. The proposed order (original only) on paper, shall be submitted directly to chambers by 12:00 noon on August 6, 2018. The conference is conducted with lead counsel present in person. No parties or representatives of parties will be permitted to attend, by Judge Richard P. Matsch on 6/21/2018. (ktera) (Entered: 06/21/2018)  |
| 06/28/2018 | <u>17</u> | Unopposed MOTION to Amend/Correct/Modify <u>1</u> Complaint,,,,, by Plaintiff Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit First Amended Complaint, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 1 – Written Request, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 2 – Cover Email, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 3 – Automatic Reply, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 4 – CREEC Email, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 5 – Automatic Reply, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 6 – Email to Bittner, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 7 – ICE-FOIA Email, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 8 – FOIA Request, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 9 – Cover Email, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 10 – Automatic Reply, #   |

|            |           |  |
|------------|-----------|--|
|            |           | <p><u>12</u> Exhibit 11 – FOIA Request, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 12 – Cover Email, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 13 – Automatic Reply, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 14 – FOIA Request, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 15 – Cover Email, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 16 – Automatic Reply, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 17 – ICE-FOIA Email, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 18 – Screenshot, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 19 – CREEC Email, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 20 – Automatic Reply, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 21 – Email to CREEC, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 22 – CREEC Email, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 23 – Automatic Reply, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 24 – Email to Bittner, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 25 – Screenshot, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 26 – Screenshot, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 27 – FOIA Request, # <u>29</u> Exhibit 28 – Cover Email, # <u>30</u> Exhibit 29 – Automatic Reply, # <u>31</u> Exhibit 30 – ICE-FOIA Email, # <u>32</u> Exhibit 31 – ICE-FOIA Email, # <u>33</u> Exhibit 32 – CREEC Response, # <u>34</u> Exhibit 33 – Automatic Acknowledgment, # <u>35</u> Exhibit 34 – Email to Bittner, # <u>36</u> Exhibit 35 – Screenshot, # <u>37</u> Exhibit 36 – Screenshot, # <u>38</u> Exhibit 37 – Report, # <u>39</u> Exhibit 38 – FOIA Request, # <u>40</u> Exhibit 39 – Cover Email, # <u>41</u> Exhibit 40 – Automatic Reply, # <u>42</u> Exhibit 41 – CREEC Email, # <u>43</u> Exhibit 42 – Automatic Reply, # <u>44</u> Exhibit 43 – Email to Bittner, # <u>45</u> Exhibit 44 – Automatic Reply, # <u>46</u> Exhibit 45 – FOIA Request, # <u>47</u> Exhibit 46 – ICE-FOIA Email, # <u>48</u> Exhibit 47 – Website, # <u>49</u> Exhibit 48 – Screenshot, # <u>50</u> Exhibit 49 – FOIA Request, # <u>51</u> Exhibit 50 – Cover Email, # <u>52</u> Exhibit 51 – ICE-FOIA Email, # <u>53</u> Exhibit 52 – Screenshot, # <u>54</u> Exhibit 53 – FOIA Request, # <u>55</u> Exhibit 54 – Cover Email, # <u>56</u> Exhibit 55 – ICE-FOIA Email, # <u>57</u> Exhibit 56 – Screenshot, # <u>58</u> Exhibit 57 – Screenshot, # <u>59</u> Exhibit 58 – FOIA Request, # <u>60</u> Exhibit 59 – Cover Email, # <u>61</u> Exhibit 60 – Email and Response, # <u>62</u> Exhibit 61 – ICE-FOIA Email, # <u>63</u> Exhibit 62 – Website)(Kelley, Thomas) (Entered: 06/28/2018)</p> |
| 06/29/2018 | <u>18</u> | ORDER Granting <u>17</u> Plaintiff's Unopposed Motion for Leave to File First Amended Complaint. The First Amended Complaint attached thereto is accepted for filing, by Judge Richard P. Matsch on 6/29/2018. (ktera) (Entered: 06/29/2018)   |
| 06/29/2018 | <u>19</u> | FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT filed by Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center. (ktera) (Entered: 06/29/2018)  |
| 07/12/2018 | <u>20</u> | Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer or Otherwise Respond re <u>19</u> Amended Complaint by Defendants United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Pestal, Mark) (Entered: 07/12/2018)   |
| 07/12/2018 | <u>21</u> | ORDER Granting <u>20</u> Defendants' motion for extension of time, to and including July 31, 2018, to respond to the amended complaint, by Judge Richard P. Matsch on 7/12/2018. (ktera) (Entered: 07/12/2018)   |
| 07/27/2018 | <u>22</u> | NOTICE of Entry of Appearance by Timothy Patrick Fox on behalf of Civil Rights Education and Enforcement CenterAttorney Timothy Patrick Fox added to party Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center(pty:pla) (Fox, Timothy) (Entered: 07/27/2018)   |
| 07/30/2018 | <u>23</u> | NOTICE of Entry of Appearance by Elizabeth B. Jordan on behalf of Civil Rights Education and Enforcement CenterAttorney Elizabeth B. Jordan added to party Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center(pty:pla) (Jordan, Elizabeth) (Entered: 07/30/2018)  |
| 07/31/2018 | <u>24</u> | ANSWER to <u>19</u> Amended Complaint by United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Pestal, Mark) (Entered: 07/31/2018)   |
| 08/06/2018 | <u>25</u> | DECLARATION of <i>Catrina Pavlik-Keenan</i> by Defendants United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Pestal, Mark) (Entered: 08/06/2018)   |
| 08/15/2018 | <u>26</u> | COURTROOM MINUTES for Scheduling Conference held before Senior Judge Richard P. Matsch on 8/15/2018. ORDERED: This matter is set for continued Scheduling Conference on September 25, 2018, at 10:00 a.m. FTR: Kathy Terasaki. (lrobe) (Entered: 08/15/2018)   |
| 08/15/2018 | <u>27</u> | ORDER SETTING FURTHER SCHEDULING CONFERENCE Pursuant to the August 15, 2018 scheduling conference, a further scheduling conference is scheduled for September 25, 2018 at 10:00 a.m. in the Conference Room, Second Floor, the Byron White United States Courthouse, 1823 Stout Street, Denver, Colorado, by Judge Richard P. Matsch on 8/15/2018. (ktera) (Entered: 08/15/2018)   |

|            |           |   |
|------------|-----------|---|
| 08/15/2018 | <u>28</u> | Utility Confirming Setting Hearings: Scheduling Conference set for 9/25/2018 10:00 AM before Judge Richard P. Matsch. Text Only Entry (evana, ) (Entered: 08/20/2018)   |
| 09/17/2018 | <u>29</u> | MOTION for Leave to <i>File Response to Defendants' 25</i> Declaration by Plaintiff Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center. (Gonzales, Amber) (Entered: 09/17/2018)  |
| 09/17/2018 | <u>30</u> | RESPONSE to <u>25</u> Declaration <i>Re ICE FOIA Office Workload and Resources</i> by Plaintiff Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Gonzales, Amber) (Entered: 09/17/2018)   |
| 09/17/2018 | <u>32</u> | ADVISORY NOTICE OF NONCOMPLIANCE WITH COURT RULES/PROCEDURES: re: <u>29</u> MOTION for Leave to File Response to Defendants' <u>25</u> Declaration filed by attorney Thomas B. Kelley. The s/signature did not match the filers name on the account for which the login and password are registered. <b>DO NOT REFILE THE DOCUMENT. Action to take</b> – future documents must be filed pursuant to D.C.COLO.LCivR 5.1(a) and 4.3(c) of the Electronic Case Filing Procedures (Civil cases).(Text Only Entry) (evana, ) (Entered: 09/18/2018) |
| 09/17/2018 | <u>33</u> | ADVISORY NOTICE OF NONCOMPLIANCE WITH COURT RULES/PROCEDURES: re: <u>30</u> Response filed by attorney Thomas B. Kelley. The s/signature did not match the filers name on the account for which the login and password are registered. <b>DO NOT REFILE THE DOCUMENT. Action to take</b> – future documents must be filed pursuant to D.C.COLO.LCivR 5.1(a) and 4.3(c) of the Electronic Case Filing Procedures (Civil cases).(Text Only Entry) (evana, ) (Entered: 09/18/2018)   |
| 09/18/2018 | <u>31</u> | ORDER Granting <u>29</u> Plaintiff's Motion for Leave to File Response to Defendants' Declaration Regarding ICE FOIA Office Workload and Resources. Plaintiff's Response Doc. <u>30</u> is accepted for filing, by Judge Richard P. Matsch on 9/18/2018. (ktera) (Entered: 09/18/2018)  |
| 09/25/2018 | <u>34</u> | MINUTE ENTRY for Scheduling Conference proceedings held before Judge Richard P. Matsch on 9/25/2018. Scheduling Order APPROVED and SIGNED with changes and interlineations. Status Conference set for 10/26/2018 10:00 AM in Courtroom A before Judge Richard P. Matsch. FTR: K. Terasaki. (babia) (Entered: 09/25/2018)  |
| 09/25/2018 | <u>35</u> | SCHEDULING ORDER approved and signed with changes and interlineations by Judge Richard P. Matsch on 9/25/2018. (babia) (Entered: 09/25/2018)  |
| 10/26/2018 | <u>36</u> | MINUTE ENTRY for proceedings held before Senior Judge Richard P. Matsch: Status Conference held on 10/26/2018. Status Conference set for 12/7/2018, at 10:00 AM, in Courtroom A before Senior Judge Richard P. Matsch. FTR: K. Terasaki. (rkeec) (Entered: 10/26/2018)  |
| 12/07/2018 | <u>37</u> | MINUTE ENTRY for Status Conference proceedings held before Judge Richard P. Matsch on 12/7/2018. ORDERED:Counsel shall meet and confer to draft and submit a proposed order requiring the agency to set out what their priority schedule is on production of documents in each category, on or before December 20, 2018. Status Conference set for 1/18/2019 10:00 AM in Courtroom A before Judge Richard P. Matsch. FTR: K. Terasaki. (babia) (Entered: 12/07/2018)  |
| 12/12/2018 | <u>38</u> | Unopposed MOTION to Clarify re <u>37</u> Status Conference,, Terminate Hearings,, Set/Reset Hearings, by Plaintiff Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – proposed Order Regarding Production Schedule)(Kelley, Thomas) (Entered: 12/12/2018)  |
| 12/20/2018 | <u>39</u> | Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>Submit Proposed Production Schedule</i> by Defendants United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Pestal, Mark) (Entered: 12/20/2018)   |
| 12/21/2018 | <u>40</u> | ORDER Granting <u>39</u> Defendants' unopposed motion for extension of time, to and including January 9, 2019, to submit a proposed production schedule. By Judge Richard P. Matsch on 12/21/2018. (ktera) (Entered: 12/21/2018)  |
| 12/21/2018 | <u>41</u> | ORDER on <u>38</u> Motion for Clarification. By Judge Richard P. Matsch on 12/21/2018. (ktera) (Entered: 12/21/2018)  |



|            |           |   |
|------------|-----------|---|
| 01/02/2019 | <u>42</u> | NOTICE of Entry of Appearance by Steven David Zansberg on behalf of All Plaintiffs Attorney Steven David Zansberg added to party Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center(pty:pla) (Zansberg, Steven) (Entered: 01/02/2019)  |
| 01/07/2019 | <u>43</u> | Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Proposed Production Schedule and to Vacate and Reset Status Conference</i> by Defendants United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Pestal, Mark) (Entered: 01/07/2019)   |
| 01/08/2019 | <u>44</u> | ORDER Upon review of Defendants' unopposed motion for an extension of time, to and including February 8, 2019, to submit a proposed production schedule and rescheduling the January 18, 2019, status conference to February 15, 2019, at 10:00 a.m., it is ORDERED that the motion is granted, by Judge Richard P. Matsch on 1/8/2019. (evana, ) (Entered: 01/08/2019) |
| 01/09/2019 | <u>45</u> | NOTICE of Change of Address/Contact Information <i>and Firm Affiliation</i> by Thomas B. Kelley (Kelley, Thomas) (Entered: 01/09/2019)  |